



3 1223 10053 9577

The Igorrote Village on the Presidio: Remnant of the U.S. Policy of Expansion?

By Elaine Elinson

An Inquiry for Golden Gate National Park/National Park Service *

Introduction:

There is a note in the Presidio Archives from 1928 that encourages the military to tear down the "Igorote Village" as fast as possible. Enlisted men had built these quarters out of salvaged material and they were now unsanitary, rotten, and unfit for animals.

There is also a map of the Presidio dated September 1928 that locates, in handwriting, the "Igorote Village"¹ between the National Cemetery and the buildings of the Main Post. It is a cluster of about a dozen small buildings surrounded by shrubbery.

What was this site? What was it used for? Who lived there? The search reveals tantalizing information about little known events in history. Though the mystery is not completely solved, the quest reveals much about the history of U.S.-Philippine relations, the role of the Presidio, and Filipinos in the United States.

With clues from newspaper articles, anthropological research, and census data pieced together against the political, cultural and military history of the early 20th Century, we can speculate. Here are some of the key elements:

The Presidio and the Philippine-American War

The role of the Presidio in the Spanish-American War and the subsequent suppression of the Philippine Insurrection is well-documented.²

The United States declared war against Spain on April 21, 1898 after the explosion of the battleship U.S.S. Maine in Havana, Cuba.

¹ The formal spelling of the group of people from the Cordillera region of the Philippines is Igorot. However, the spelling varied in different documents prepared by various military and government agencies. In this paper, we will use the spelling Igorot, unless referring specifically to a citation or a site that used a different version. Anthropologist Dr. Patricia Afable believes that the usage of "Igorrote" in the exposition/exhibition materials began with Richard Schneidewind who ran the Filipino Exhibition Company, to distinguish his group from the rival Igorot Exhibit Company, run by Truman Hunt. "Igorrote" was the Spanish word and was common in 18th and 19th century maps and documents (long before the Schneidewind began his venture).

² An exhibit, curated by Dr. Randolph Delehanty, "The U.S. in the Philippines, 1898-1915: War and Dissent," was on display at the Presidio in 2008.

The Igorrote Village on the Presidio: Remnant of the U.S. Policy of Expansion?

By Elaine Elinson

An Inquiry for Golden Gate National Park/National Park Service *

Introduction:

There is a note in the Presidio Archives from 1928 that encourages the military to tear down the "Igorrote Village" as fast as possible. Enlisted men had built these quarters out of salvaged material and they were now unsanitary, rotten, and unfit for animals.

There is also a map of the Presidio dated September 1928 that locates, in handwriting, the "Igorote Village"¹ between the National Cemetery and the buildings of the Main Post. It is a cluster of about a dozen small buildings surrounded by shrubbery.

What was this site? What was it used for? Who lived there? The search reveals tantalizing information about little known events in history. Though the mystery is not completely solved, the quest reveals much about the history of U.S.-Philippine relations, the role of the Presidio, and Filipinos in the United States.

With clues from newspaper articles, anthropological research, and census data pieced together against the political, cultural and military history of the early 20th Century, we can speculate. Here are some of the key elements:

The Presidio and the Philippine-American War

The role of the Presidio in the Spanish-American War and the subsequent suppression of the Philippine Insurrection is well-documented.²

The United States declared war against Spain on April 21, 1898 after the explosion of the battleship U.S.S. Maine in Havana, Cuba.

¹ The formal spelling of the group of people from the Cordillera region of the Philippines is Igorot. However, the spelling varied in different documents prepared by various military and government agencies. In this paper, we will use the spelling Igorot, unless referring specifically to a citation or a site that used a different version. Anthropologist Dr. Patricia Afable believes that the usage of "Igorrote" in the exposition/exhibition materials began with Richard Schneidewind who ran the Filipino Exhibition Company, to distinguish his group from the rival Igorot Exhibit Company, run by Truman Hunt. "Igorrote" was the Spanish word and was common in 18th and 19th century maps and documents (long before the Schneidewind began his venture).

² An exhibit, curated by Dr. Randolph Delehanty, "The U.S. in the Philippines, 1898-1915: War and Dissent," was on display at the Presidio in 2008.

The Spanish-American War officially ended with the Treaty of Paris: the United States acquired the former Spanish colonies, including “purchasing” the Philippines for \$20 million. Thus began the future of the United States as an imperial power, from the Caribbean to the Pacific.

Filipinos had been fighting against Spanish colonialism, which had dominated their country for three centuries. One of the revolutionary leaders, Emilio Aguinaldo, struck a deal with the Americans, hoping that U.S. support would help them overthrow Spanish rule. However, after the Spanish were defeated, the independence fighters found they had a new enemy: the United States. Though the U.S. declared the war officially over in 1902, guerrilla resistance continued as late as 1915 – so troops continued to go back and forth from the Presidio to the Philippines.

The first troops from the Presidio left for the Spanish colony of the Philippines in May 1898. Even though the war itself was short-lived, over the next decade, 80,000 U.S. soldiers passed through the Presidio on their way to and from the Philippines. Nearly all the troops who went to the Philippines spent time at the Presidio. This large number of troops spurred the transition of the Presidio from a frontier military outpost to a modern army base.

The number of soldiers for this expansive venture overwhelmed the existing facilities. A note in the Presidio archives from May 1899 states that returning soldiers lived in old wooden barracks where “the sewage system [was] deplorable – human exhalations, kitchen refuse and other poisons.” That year, to alleviate the conditions, a “model camp” was prepared for volunteers returning from the Philippines.

The Philippine Scouts was a military group formed of Filipino soldiers who sided with the U.S. military to quash the revolution. In 1901, a regiment of Philippine Scouts arrived in the Presidio. There is no record of how long they remained there, or where they lived on base.

In pursuing the colonization of the Philippines, President William McKinley said that he got down on his knees and prayed to God who told him to “uplift and civilize and Christianize them.”

Though those in power were strongly behind this war of U.S. expansion in the Philippines, there was also growing opposition. Mark Twain wrote the famous anti-war essay “To the Person Sitting in Darkness” <http://xroads.virginia.edu/~drbt/sitting.html> and he and other intellectual and social leaders, including Jane Addams, Ambrose Bierce, Samuel Gompers and Andrew Carnegie formed the U.S. Anti-Imperialist League. Their numbers grew as reports came back from the Philippines of atrocities committed against the Filipino people, massacres of entire villages and the use of torture, including the first water boarding, against the revolutionaries. The war brought 4,000 U.S. casualties, and 20,000 Filipino deaths.

Clearly there was an ideological battle to be fought at home.

“Wild Men” v. Civilization: Bringing Igorots to the U.S.

U.S. government officials devised a plan to support their expansionist policy: they would bring the “wild men” of the Philippines and put them on display in the United States to show the public how crucial it was for the U.S. to “uplift and civilize” the people in its new colonial possession.

“This is the first and best opportunity we have had to justify,” William I. Buchanan, Director-General of the Pan American Exposition in Buffalo wrote in a letter to J.H. Brigham, Chairman of the Government Exhibition Board, in December 1899, “by means of the most available object lessons we can produce, the acquisition of a new territory, to demonstrate, as I am sure can be done, that the results to be obtained promise to be for us all ample compensation for the sacrifice already made, and for the burdens yet to be assumed.”

This was also the moment when anthropology and ethnology were in their early stages, and U.S. and European universities sent expeditions to far off lands in search of exotic and primitive people to study. Part of the impetus for the early growth of these social sciences was to establish racial hierarchies based on such flimsy evidence as head measurements and documentation of unfamiliar and poorly-understood religious and cultural rituals.

Several anthropologists had gone to the Philippines to study the tribal people of the Cordillera region Northern Luzon. In 1903, the *National Geographic* did a spread on the people of the region. Anthropologist Albert Jenks conducted fieldwork in 1902, and his ethnographic information was used in the brochures describing the tribes people at expositions in the U.S. Jenks, who worked for the U.S. government, brought over people from the region to the Fair, some of whom lived with him and his wife.

The government sent Frank F. Hilder to the Philippines to gather materials – such as baskets, weapons, instruments, clothing, and other artifacts for the Pan-American Exposition in Buffalo in 1901. One hundred Filipinos were brought to the fairgrounds to live in an 11-acre enclosure modeled on a Philippine village – complete with thatched huts, water buffalo pulling carts, a lake and a Catholic Church.³ The *Buffalo Courier* editorialized, “the tidings of the goodness and greatness which the Filipinos will take back will be a great help in the furtherment of the United States Government’s policy there.”

The Pan-American Exposition also included a replica of an African slave market and the belly dancer “Little Egypt – the darling of the Nile” who wowed the crowds with her “hootchy-kootchy dance.”

But the biggest splash was yet to come.

³ Although historian Robert Rydell cites several Buffalo newspaper accounts of Filipinos at the Pan-American Exposition, Dr. Patricia Afable notes that she found no evidence in the Hilder papers that Igorots were actually at that fair.

In 1904, St. Louis hosted the World's Fair, by far the largest exposition ever. The Fair was to celebrate the centennial of the Louisiana Purchase, but the displays were also intended to enshrine ideas of racial superiority, cultural hegemony and manifest destiny. One historian called it a "self-consciously definitive event for the world's newest colonial power."

William Howard Taft, then governor-general of the Philippines, was quoted in the *World's Fair Bulletin* as believing that the exhibit would have a "moral effect" on Filipinos and that their participation would "be a very great influence in bringing Filipinos to improve their condition." The U.S. government spent one million dollars on the Philippine Reservation.

The Philippine Reservation was the largest and most popular attraction at the fair, with more than 100 buildings on 47 acres. Fairgoers had to walk two miles and cross over the moss-covered Bridge of Spain, which spanned Arrowhead Lake, to get to the site.

And fairgoers flocked to the site. An estimated ninety-nine percent of the visitors to the World's Fair went to the Philippine Reservation. William P. Wilson, chair of the U.S. government Philippine Exposition Board, called it "the greatest exhibition of the most marvelous Exposition in the history of the world..." and claimed it to be the "finest colonial exhibit" created by any government in history.

The Philippine Reservation had more than 40 exhibits and 1,400 participants. At the entrance, were displays of the U.S. military triumphs in the Philippines, and paths led to displays from many different provinces. But the "civilized and Christianized" Visayans did not draw much attention. The most widely (and luridly) publicized, and by far the most attended was the Igorot Village. The gate receipts of the Igorot Village quadrupled the exhibits of the Visayans and tripled that of the Moros. An estimated 5,000 people a day visited the Igorot Village.

The advertising flyers were sensational: they depicted tattooed women smoking cigars, and near-naked men in wild, ritualistic dances. The Igorots lived in thatched huts that they built themselves and performed dances to gong music at set times during the day.

The biggest draw was the "Igorot dog feast." These sacred rituals were put on display for a voyeuristic public. The emphasis on the "civilized" verses the "primitive" resulted in its reinforcing racial and ethnic stereotypes.

Even though dog-eating was a practice for special occasions in the Cordilleras, the Igorots at the fair had to cook and eat dog every day, leading to racist cartoons of club-wielding Igorot being warned by Humane Society. The American term for a frankfurter originated at the World's Fair – tourists lined up to ogle Igorot villagers cooking and eating dog. Vendors then sold frankfurters as "hot dogs" outside the Philippine Reservation at the Fair.

The St. Louis Public Library holds an extensive collection of photos from the Fair, including Canine Cuisine, Igorots Cast Votes, Crossing the Bridge, Meeting Antonio, Negritos Share Skills and Customs, Getting Married at the Fair.

<http://exhibits.slpl.org/lpe/data/LPE240023338.asp?thread=240029452>

Their near-nakedness and unusual rituals caused quite a scandal. Government officials voiced their concern over the balance between “savagery and civilization.” Secretary of War William Howard Taft (former governor of Philippines) sent a telegram to War Department Colonel Clarence Edwards who was in charge of Philippine affairs, stating: “The President has heard severe criticism of the Igorrotes and the wild tribe exhibit on the ground that it verges toward the indecent. He believes either the Igorrotes and wild tribes should be sent home or that they should be more fully clad.”

This led to a cartoon in the *St. Louis Post-Dispatch* of Taft with a pair of trousers in his hands chasing an Igorot clad only in a G-string.

One way of resolving the balance was to show the more “civilized” side of the Philippines. When President Theodore Roosevelt visited the Fair, a missionary school teacher led her class of Igorots in a chorus of “My Country ‘Tis of Thee.” The President was pleased, remarking on “such advancement in so short a time.”

The “civilized” Philippines was epitomized by the smartly-uniformed, disciplined Filipino Scouts and Philippine Constabulary who were also on display. These 700 soldiers and police were actually part of the Filipino population that sided with the U.S. military in suppressing the ongoing insurrection.

The Scouts were there to keep order but also juxtaposed to show the difference between the civilized and the primitive. However, the presence of the Scouts highlighted other contradictions.

When the young soldiers accepted the invitation of young white women school teachers to accompany them on tours of the fairground, they were taunted by the Southern white fairgoers as “nigger.” In one instance, U.S. Marines and the Exposition’s police force (the Jefferson Guards) threatened to arrest the women and kicked their Filipino escorts to the ground.

One report describes several Marines attacking the Philippine Scouts, shooting their revolvers in the air and shouting, “Let’s clean the Gu-Gus off the earth.” That racial epithet was frequently used by U.S. troops in the Philippines during the war.

The Philippine Scouts again stopped at the Presidio. In January, 1904, four companies of Scouts arrived at the Presidio heading for the Fair; they stayed at the “infantry cantonment,” and departed for St. Louis in March. A year later, from March 29-31, the Philippine Scouts again passed through the Presidio on their way home to the Philippines from the Fair.

The Igorots: Where Did They Come From and Where did they go after the World's Fair

Although the display of the Igorots was originally under government auspices, after the World's Fair the government "lost control of the trope," according to historian Christopher A. Vaughan. Some opportunistic American entrepreneurs, seeing the popularity of putting "wild people" on display, sought to profit from exhibiting Filipinos at other fairs, expositions, and eventually sideshows and amusement parks. They contacted the Igorots at the fair, and arranged with them to return to the Bontoc region and recruit friends and relatives to tour the U.S.

In the Philippine census of 1903, conducted by U.S. officials, Igorots and other mountain tribes people were listed under the category of "wild Peoples." The Bontoc expression for those who went to America (Malika) is Nikimalika.

The most comprehensive writing about the people who were brought from the region to the United States for the exhibit is by anthropologist Patricia Afable, formerly of the Smithsonian Institute. She notes that the Cordillera people from the Bontoc, Abra and Suyoc region were lumped together as Igorots for their U.S. sojourn.

Afable warns researchers not to underestimate the agency of the Igorots in the U.S. enterprise. Because they were exhibited as an exotic spectacle, they have been portrayed as exploited. However, Afable asserts, the Igorots agreed to travel far from home for pay, made a great effort to do so, and signed contracts for that opportunity. She seeks to dispel the notion that they were "passive and silent participants." Once they decided to make the journey, they had to take a 2-4 day trek to the coast where they would catch the boat for Manila. Some had learned a little Spanish or English by working for gold miners, military or missionaries.

Afable, who has done extensive interviews with descendants of the Igorots of the Fair both in the Philippines and in the U.S. and has combed hundreds of documents to record the names and places of origin of the Igorots who traveled in the U.S., tells of groups of young people who went to America without their parents' permission. Some teenagers eluded their parents by departing at night and boarding a boat that would take them to Manila.

The Igorots joked about the young men who became "chiefs" during the Fairs and getting so tired of the fatty dog meat that they would bury it at the edge of the grounds. Some reported that Americans were somewhat gullible for they would buy anything offered them for sale, like roughly-made spears and hastily braided grass rings and bracelets that the makers learned to hawk to their audiences as traditional handicrafts.

There were even some non-Igorot men in Christian towns who, seeking adventure, "put away their trousers and donned loincloths so they could get into the troupes and travel abroad." By 1915 no rural area in the northern Philippines had as many well-traveled people as the Bontoc – some of the more experienced ones had been to all major American cities and several European ones as well, Afable writes.

The hucksters who organized the tours also had previous experience in the Philippines, having served in the war. Some of them ventured into the northern mountainous Cordillera region to seek their fortune mining gold.

Truman Hunt, who had served as an army surgeon in Manila and became Lt. Governor of the Lepanto-Bontoc province was a key organizer of the Igorot Village at the World's Fair and also ran a soft drink stand there. He had organized transportation to the United States (on the train journey from the coast, several Igorots became ill and two died when the heat in the cars was shut off.)

Hunt, along with Fair showman Edmund Felder and anthropologist Samuel McGowan founded the International Anthropological Exhibit Company, planning to stage a national exhibition tour of Filipinos. The plan was to have them perform in the South in winter, and move North during the warmer weather. Even before the St. Louis Fair ended, they struck a deal to display them at the 1905 Lewis and Clark Centennial Exposition in Portland.

Hunt returned in December 1904 to recruit tribes people from Bontoc. In March 1905, Hunt he signed a contract with 50 Igorots to come to U.S. for \$15 a month and expenses. That group never did make it to the Lewis & Clark Fair in Portland – but they traveled to other sites in the West Coast before heading South and East.

At the same time, Richard Schneidewind set up the rival Filipino Exhibition Company (FEC) for the same purpose. After Hunt and Felder split over business decisions, the latter joined with Schneidewind. The two had met at the World's Fair where Schneidewind ran a tobacco concession and was the supply officer for the Visayan village.

Schneidewind had served in the Philippine war and was briefly married to a Filipina. He had been fired from a mail clerk job in Manila.

The two private companies brought groups of “Wild Men” shows to the Lewis and Clark Exhibition in Portland in 1905 (where they were also were the top draw of the fair and won several prizes). At the Alaska-Yukon-Pacific Exhibition in Seattle in 1909, the Filipino Exhibition Company put them right at the head of the midway. In an attempt to legitimize the exhibit with an academic veneer, Schneidewind invited a Cambridge anthropologist to offer a University of Washington summer school course “The Growth of Cultural Evolution around the Pacific,” drawing examples from the Igorot Village. In the International Railway Journal, the author notes that the “Igorotes are government wards” and that “Uncle Sam permits them to be shown the world over for the purpose of educating the public...about the little brown brother of the Philippines.”

Between 1905 and 1913, 200 Bontoc men and women had 1-2 year contracts for international expositions, county fairs and amusement parks and traveled to 50 cities.

The U.S. government through the Bureau of Insular Affairs tried to have oversight of the companies. Soon the thin barrier between education and entertainment began to erode. The companies also violated the agreement with the War Department to return the Filipinos home.

Hunt turned out to be a corrupt and abusive employer. He was accused of stealing money from the Igorots and beating them; two of the Igorots on his tour died. He was

reported to the police in 3 cities. Bontoc leader Julio Balinag played a major role in the US government investigation of Hunt.

Hunt tried to elude authorities by moving his troupe every few days. But in Chicago the police found 18 people living in tents under a roller coaster in Sans Souci Park. They were hungry, cold and unpaid. Schneidewind, no doubt seeking a profitable advantage, encouraged the U.S. War Department to investigate and file charges against Hunt. A jury found him guilty and he spent 8 months in prison in Memphis. Some of the Igorots in Hunt's group returned home, broke because Hunt had not paid them, others joined the FEC.

Afable notes that the five Igorots who were detained to testify and translate in the court cases were unable to return to Bontoc until early 1907. She states, "After their long ordeal in the United States, they were dealt yet another blow on their way out, as their blankets, jewelry and other belongings were stolen while *in storage at the Presidio barracks in San Francisco.*" [emphasis added]

Is it possible that this group that lived – at least temporarily – in the Igorrote Village on the Presidio?

Afable thinks this is a good guess because, by that time, the Bontoc party were strictly government wards, no longer under the care of either Hunt or Schneidewind. "They probably made enough of an impression during a several-week wait to have the Presidio site named after them," she writes. "It was common during that period to arrange for free military transport for returnees such as these, who were not covered by the bonds raised by the showmen."⁴

Igorots Arrive in San Francisco

A headline in the *San Francisco Chronicle* on November 3, 1905 declares "Head-Hunting Igorrotes Here." The article states that under the auspices of Richard Schneidewind, 25 Igorrotes – "that wild tribe of the Philippines whose ruling passion is the cutting off of human heads...have established a village after the manner of their native habitations at Central Park, on Market Street."

The group consisted of 18 men and 7 women, including Domingo, the "venerable old savage with white hair, who is the chief of the group" and 18-year-old Watana, who now dresses in a calico skirt and an old military coat "which was probably worn by one of Uncle Sam's soldiers while on some foray thorough her native village."

According to the *Chronicle*, Schneidewind "secured the sanction of the Government to bring these barbarians to America for exhibition purposes."

And exhibit them he did. On November 4, a display ad in the *Chronicle* proclaims in capital letters: Opens Today: Igorrotes – Head-Hunting, Dog-Eating Wild

⁴ Personal correspondence with Dr. Patricia Afable.

People from the Philippine Islands. Illustrating tribal life, manners, customs, costumes and industries during a limited engagement at Central Park,⁵ Market and Eighth, Three Gold Medals at Portland Exposition.

Similar ads appeared in further editions of both the *Chronicle* and the *Call*.

The visit of the Igorots to San Francisco served another purpose as well. In the 1906 edition of the *American Anthropologist* there is a short article by leading U.C. Berkeley anthropologist A.L. Kroeber, considered one of the founding fathers of the field of anthropology. He explains that “through the courtesy of Mr. Schneidewind” the U.C. Department of Anthropology had the opportunity to take the measurements of 18 men and 7 women from Bontoc, Tacucan and several other Igorot villages. He also made observations on the color of their skin, noting “the women gave the impression of being darker than the men.”

In the *San Francisco Call* on November 5 there is a disturbingly racist headline: Igorrotes Devastate Canine Population and Nobody's Towser is Shown Mercy. In a pathetic attempt at humor, the unsigned column states that “Fido, Towser, Jack and Bruno have taken to the pines...since the Igorrote Village erected its nipa huts in our midst.” The article includes a putative menu of the Igorrote Village, with a variety of dishes made from Skye terrier, water spaniel and Great Dane.

The last article about the Igorots in San Francisco was printed in the *Chronicle* on November 22 and is headlined “Handsomest Igorrote Ill with Tonsilitis.” It reports that Uguoy was admitted to the Central Emergency Hospital, accompanied by Schneidewind and Ontario, an English speaker. The article notes that the cold weather has brought illness to the villagers and that they are planning to leave for “sunny Southern California.”

By January 14, ads begin to appear in the *Los Angeles Herald* for Igorrote Village at Chutes Park in Los Angeles, appearing with Chiaffarelli’s Italian Band and Professor Bilyck’s troupe of educated sea lions.

Schneidewind had signed contracts for Los Angeles Chutes Park for an exhibition advertised on handbills as “The Call of the Wild: Head-Hunting, Dog-Eating, Wild People from the Philippines.” The ads appeared in the *Herald* on a daily basis for several weeks. [There was a Chutes Park in San Francisco but there is no evidences of any performances in the programs from any of its locations in the Haight, the Avenues or Playland.]

Schneidewind’s contract with the 25 Igorots provided monthly salaries of \$10 to older members, and lower rates to the younger members; all transportation, lodging and food. Three of the members Antero, Felingao and Bugti signed their names to the contract, the rest were marked with an X. While in Los Angeles, three of boys, Antero,

⁵ This is the same park that inspired the poem “Casey at the Bat” a few years earlier.

Bugti and Felingao, were enrolled in the 16th Street School. They hoped to be able to continue their studies, but by the spring they were out of school and en route to Chicago.

Other San Francisco Clues

Though the FEC group left for Los Angeles, there were a few more interesting mentions in the San Francisco papers, each relevant in their own way. A very small item in the June 16, 1905 edition of the *Chronicle*, entitled “Soldiers Beat Filipinos,” is about a baseball game played on the Presidio between the “regular nine” of the Presidio and members of the Twenty-third infantry who had just returned from the Philippines and called themselves “Tagalogs.”

On May 20, 1907 the *San Francisco Chronicle* reports “Forty One Savages from Bontoc Province Will Give Exhibitions at the Exposition.” The exhibition they are referring to is the one across the country at Jamestown Tercentennial Exposition in Virginia [another article says no Igorrotes there – so something must have happened to them along the way].

The article reports that the group, again sponsored by Schneidewind, arrived on the Japanese steamer Nippon Maru and “despite the cold air that blew, the Igorrotes, almost naked stood about on the steerage deck of the liner and gazed with awe upon surrounding evidence civilization.”

There was also a rumor, the article notes, that the group “had been imported by Calhoun for purpose of breaking the car strike – but this was denied by R. Schneidewind. [There was a bitter street car strike in San Francisco in 1907 – the strikers were met with violence, several people were killed and many injured.]

Interestingly, the article states that Schneidewind was given permission to bring the Igorots here by Governor Smith but that “various missionaries and many prominent Filipinos strongly objected to the proposition...”

Finally, there is a story in *The Call* on December 26, 1906 headlined “Filipinos Condemn Igorrote Show.” The protest came from Filipino students at U.C. Berkeley objecting to the “exhibit of the weird Igorrotes” at the coming Jamestown Exposition. Their protest highlights the continuing link to the U.S. government. They directed their protest to W. A. Sutherland, who was the supervisor of the students in the U.S. However, Sutherland took a leave of absence to return to the Philippines to “secure a party of the islands’ aborigines.” The editorial stance of the paper supported the students, and condemned the “contemptible traffic in human flesh” and to ask why Sutherland does not exhibit the 175 Filipino students now in America instead of making “a few dollars by exhibiting naked Igorrotes.”

There were also protests in the Philippines. Many Filipinos considered these carnival “Wild Men” shows as a national embarrassment. By 1911, people in the Bontoc region did not want to send any more people with Schneidewind’s FEC although Governor Forbes said they could enter into contracts. The Lepanto-Bontoc leadership used many methods to keep their people from leaving: instituting a quarantine, charging they had to pay a tax, and even telling the French that the putative travelers had trachoma.

According to historian Vaughan, “For the US government, Igorot exhibitions had gone from hot product to hot potato...”

After 1909, there was no more government sponsorship and the U.S. tightened immigration controls to prevent more Igorrote Village shows. The FEC could only place the Igorrote sideshow in commercial venues (as opposed to quasi-governmental expositions). Schneidewind took a group to Europe in 1911. There he got into financial trouble. In Ghent, several Igorots were found wandering the streets, starving. They told the U.S. Consul that Schneidewind had abandoned them

In 1914 legislation was passed by US government in Philippines to put an end to the Igorot shows. By the time of the 1915 Pan Pacific Exposition held on the Presidio, the Philippine exhibit was of a very different nature than the St. Louis World's Fair.

The Presidio and the 1915 Panama Pacific Exposition of 1915 – A Different Philippine Exhibit, a Different Message

The Presidio was one of the sites of the 1915 Pan Pacific Exposition. The exposition, covering 635 acres (including the Palace of Fine Arts and other sites along the Marina District) was intended to celebrate the opening of the Panama Canal and to showcase the city of San Francisco's remarkable recovery from the 1906 earthquake and fire. It had thousands of exhibits – ranging from different country and state pavilions to medical and scientific displays – and fireworks every night.

The Philippine pavilion was one of the largest. However, unlike the primitive thatched huts of the Igorot Village at the St. Louis World's Fair, this Philippine pavilion displayed the cultural and educational achievements of the U.S. colony. One of the goals was to “show off” the Philippines public schools under the American regime – and there was a replica of a well-ordered disciplined classroom filled with formally dressed students sitting upright at desks. The exhibit highlighted the industrial education programs in the schools, modeled after Booker T. Washington’s “Negro education,” which was the focus of early education policies in Manila.

The main building had a frieze of Tindalo wood and windows of translucent capiz shells under its low-pitched roofs. A conservatory bloomed with hundreds of orchids. The brochures boasted the pavilion “best symbolized the moral dignity of the United States in the building of the Philippine Islands. Every American can take patriotic pride.”

Twenty-seven provinces sent displays of native arts and handicrafts, including wooden carvings, pina and jusi cloths and embroidery. The goods on sale were valued at \$100,000.

There is no evidence of a display of Igorots, however anthropologist Patricia Afable notes that in 1914, fourteen people from Tucucan bound for the PPIE were organized by Harry Indian Miller and Harold L. Anfinger, former constabulary officers in the Bontoc district. They were denied entrance into the PPIE, although they did travel to some venues in California. Anfinger was charged by the U.S. government with kidnapping minors from Bontoc. Anfinger had a child by one of the Bontoc women on the tour, and that child was left in the U.S.

By the way, Richard Schneidewind, thwarted in his attempts to bring Igorots to the Panama Pacific Exposition, managed the Samoan Village there!

Who Lived in the Presidio's Igorrote Village?

There are two specific mentions of "Igorrote Village" in the archives of the Presidio.

One is a map from 1928 that shows a cluster of a dozen small buildings and the hand-written notation "Igorote Village."

The other is a hand-written note from September 13, 1928 from Colonel F.R. Brown, commanding officer of the 30th Infantry to the Ninth Corps Area, that states: Requesting permission to destroy all temporary bldgs. In "Igorrote Village" as fast as vacated. Quarters build by E.M. (enlisted men) out of salvaged material. Unsanitary, rotten. Not even fit for animals."

A search of this area through earlier maps/notes of the Presidio indicates that there was a group of 1898 company kitchens and bathhouses, and many of wood frame structures that "Enlisted labor had hastily assembled the buildings in the Spanish-American War emergency and again in the 1903 construction of the recruits' Infantry Cantonment. They had been converted to noncommissioned officers' quarters in 1915. Wooden buildings in the East and West Cantonments had begun falling apart in the 1920s.

http://archive.org/stream/presidiofsanfra00deparich/presidiofsanfra00deparich_djvu.txt

Leo Barker, the archeologist of the Presidio, notes that the site – which lies between the current day Golden Gate Club and the National Cemetery – may have been built as quarters for noncommissioned officers (pre-1915). They were built as temporary structures in the West Cantonment before more permanent housing was built.

A search of the U.S. Census from 1900 – 1930 provides scant information about Filipinos (and even less about Igorots) living on the Presidio. The Presidio is listed at Assembly District 39, and Enumeration Districts 221 and 222. However, the U.S. Census lists very few addresses *inside* the Presidio, thus limiting our search to the entire living quarters on the base.

The 1900 San Francisco Census shows no people born in the Philippines living in the Presidio census tracts. However, by 1910, there were 238 Philippine-born people living there. Most of them are listed as "Servants." As for Race, some are designated "White" and some are designated "Black." [There are also two Philippine-born males listed as "servants" living on Alcatraz at the United States Military Prison in the 1910 census.]

There is no indication – nor any place for it in the Census Records – that these individuals lived in the area on the base called “Igorrote Village” or if they were Igorots. They may very well have been non-Igorot Filipinos who returned as servants with U.S. Army officers who served in the Philippines.

The name may just have been adopted in disparaging irony since the buildings may have looked like primitive dwellings. There is also evidence that soldiers returning from the war in the Philippines adopted Filipino terms. For example, the *Chronicle* in June 1905 entitled “Soldiers Beat Filipinos” is actually about a baseball team between the Presidio regulars and the “recently returned Twenty-third Infantry” from their successes in Mindanao (southernmost islands of the Philippines). The latter team adopted the team name “Tagalogs.”

Perhaps our best guess is that it was named after the Bontoc group who passed through the Presidio in 1907. After having been abused and cheated by Truman Hunt (who was arrested, convicted and jailed – albeit briefly -- for his crimes), this group had to remain in the U.S. to testify against him, and were made wards of the government, before they could return home to the Philippines. One note in anthropologist Afable’s research shows that “their belongings were stolen while in storage at the Presidio barracks.” That note might be the clue to solving the puzzle.

We did find one person who listed her actual address at the Igorrote Village on the Presidio. The 1927 City Directory lists “Mrs. Bona E. Short, typist” living at “4 Igorrote Village, Presidio.

Who is Mrs. Bona E. Short? By the following year, she no longer lived at 4 Igorrote Village – but on Broderick Street in a rooming house. The 1930 Census describes her as an Arkansas-born, white female, born about 1902 living at 856 Broderick Street and working as a book-keeper stenographer for the U.S. Government. We know she is not an Igorot, but she is the only person that we know for sure lived at the “Igorrote Village” on the Presidio.

Dr. Patricia Afable has created a remarkable record of the names of almost all the Igorots – numbering in the hundreds -- who came to the United States, scouring court records, company contracts, and other documents. If there were time and research personnel (student interns?) it may be useful to match up those names with all of the Census Records on the Presidio from 1900-1940, and to match whatever addresses are listed with early maps of the base. Presidio archivist Amanda Williford cautions, however, that the records of who lived in the buildings is incomplete (since many people were there for such a short time) and that the numbers of the buildings changed through the years.

The mystery of who actually lived in the Igorrote Village on the Presidio will take more digging. And not just in libraries and archives. Archeologist Leo Barker and GIS specialist Hans Barnaal think that a dig under the site designated “Igorrote Village” might possibly turn up some evidence about who lived there and when. We may have to trade in our pencils and computers and pick up a shovel to solve this mystery.

*Attribution: This research paper was commissioned by the Golden Gate Parks Conservancy and National Park Service for Dissonant Voices, the annual educational workshop for secondary social studies teachers.

Acknowledgements:

Librarians and archivists are generally a very helpful bunch, but with this research I have been fortunate to be advised and assisted by some of the most insightful and curious people from across the country. Several answered my initial questions and then went on to do their own digging and called me back with suggestions – ideas I never would have thought of. I want to express my deep appreciation to the following for their thoughtful, generous support!

Golden Gate National Park: Lynn Fonfa, Leo Barker, Amanda Williford

Presidio Trust: Hans Barnaal, Randolph Delehanty

San Francisco Public Library: Tom Carey, Lisa Dunseth, Janice Torbet, Brian Weaver, Tim Wilson, Kate Wingerson

Smithsonian Institution: Patricia Afable, James Early

U.C. Berkeley/Bancroft Library: Susan Snyder, Kathleen Gallagher

Found San Francisco: Chris Carlsson

California Historical Society: Mary Morganti, Alison Moore, Eileen Keremitsis

Independent scholars: Abe Ignacio, Rene CiriaCruz

Bibliography: Igorrote Village on the Presidio

Books:

Rydell, R. W. *All the World's a Fair: Visions of Empire at American International Expositions 1876-1916.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984.

Schirmer, Daniel B. *Republic or Empire: American Resistance to the Philippine War.* Cambridge, MA: Schenkman Publishing, 1972.

Thompson, Erwin N. *Defender of the Gate, Historic Resource Study, The Presidio.* 1997.

Todd, Frank Morton. *The Story of the Exposition.* Volume 3. "Aspects of Foreign, Domestic and Colonial Education." Volume 3-4: New York: Knickerbocker Press, 1921.

Vaughan, Christopher A. "Ogling Igorots: The Politics and Commerce of Exhibiting Cultural Otherness, 1898-1913" in *Freakery: Cultural Spectacles of the Human Body*, editor, Rosemarie G. Thompson, New York: NYU Press, 1996

Zamora, Maria C. *Nation, Race & History in Asian American Literature (Modern American Literature).* New York: Peter Lang, 2008.

Journal Articles

Afable, Patricia O. "Journeys from Bontoc to the Western Fairs: 1904-1914: The Nikimalika and their Interpreters." *Philippine Studies*, vol. 52, no. 4 (2004), 445-473, Ateneo de Manila University, Manila.

_____. Nikimalika, the "Igorrotes of the Early Twentieth Century Fairs: A Chronology and Name Lists." *Igorot Quarterly*. Vol 9.4, 2000. (West Covina, CA)

_____. "The Exhibition of Cordillerans in the United States During the Early 1900s. *Igorot Quarterly*, Vol 6.2. 1997 (West Covina, CA)

Kroeber, A. "Measurements of Igorotes," *American Anthropologist*, N.S. 8, 1906.

Newspapers

Head-hunting Igorrotes' here. (1905, Nov 03). *San Francisco Chronicle (1869-Current File)*. Retrieved from
<http://ezproxy.sfpl.org/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/365808318?accountid=35117>

Handsomest igorrote ill with tonsilitis. (1905, Nov 22). *San Francisco Chronicle (1869-Current File)*. Retrieved from
<http://ezproxy.sfpl.org/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/365650737?accountid=35117>

San Francisco Call. November 9, 1905. "Igorrotes Devastate Canine Population and Nobody's Towser is Shown Mercy."

Ad for Chutes Park, Los Angeles, Igorrote Village, Los Angeles Herald - 1906

<http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn85042462/1906-01-14/ed-1/seq-2/#date1=1904&index=8&rows=20&words=IGORROTE+VILLAGE&searchType=basic&sequence=0&state=California&date2=1910&proxtext=Igorrote+Village&y=10&x=11&dateFilterType=yearRange&page=1>

Igorrote boys will be sent to school. (1906, Jan 21). *San Francisco Chronicle (1869-Current File)*. Retrieved from
<http://ezproxy.sfpl.org/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/251461517?accountid=35117>

Forty-one savages from bontoc province will give exhibitions at the exposition. (1907, May 20). *San Francisco Chronicle (1869-Current File)*. Retrieved from
<http://ezproxy.sfpl.org/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/251400190?accountid=35117>

"Three Igorrote Boys Will Attend Los Angeles School." San Francisco Call, January 21, 1906.

Gaar, Greg. "Shoot the Chutes." *Haight-Ashbury Newspaper*, April, 1982.

Maps

<http://www.oac.cdlib.org/findaid/ark:/13030/kt7p30275f/in>

Map of Central Park at 8th and Market Streets

http://www.davidrumsey.com/luna/servlet/detail/RUMSEY~8~1~213960~5501185?qvq=q:1905+Sanborn+maps+of+San+Francisco;sort:Pub_List_No_InitialSort,Pub_Date,Pub_List_No,Series_No;lc:RUMSEY~8~1&mi=76&trs=378

Presidio Maps (see under Presidio Archives, below)

Interviews

Dr. Patricia Afable, anthropologist, Smithsonian Institution (retired)

Leo Barker, archeologist, Golden Gate National Parks

Hans Barnaal, GIS Specialist, Presidio Trust

Randolph Delehanty, historian, Presidio Trust

Archival files:

Presidio Archives

Maps

Notes from Erwin M. Thomson, Historic Resource II

History Room, San Francisco Public Library

Panama Pacific International Exposition files:

Newspaper Clips

Philippines

Programs

Chutes

Pamphlets and programs from The Chutes, San Francisco

Government Room, San Francisco Public Library

U.S. Census 1910 -1940 (ancestry.com)

San Francisco City Directory, 1924-1930

California Historical Society

Filipinos in San Francisco (1904 Banquet for Bd. of Filipino Commission to St. Louis Expo)

Philippine Exhibit Souvenir Guide, (St. Louis 1904)

Bancroft Library

Kroeber Papers (check link from Susan Snyder)

Internet Archive

Ad for Chutes Park, Los Angeles, Igorrote Village:

<http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn85042462/1906-01-14/ed-1/seq-2/#date1=1904&index=8&rows=20&words=IGORROTE+VILLAGE&searchType=basic&sequence=0&state=California&date2=1910&proxtext=Igorrote+Village&y=10&x=11&dateFilterType=yearRange&page=1>

Igorrote boys will be sent to school. (1906, Jan 21). *San Francisco Chronicle (1869-Current File)*. Retrieved from
<http://ezproxy.sfpl.org/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/251461517?accountid=35117>

Handsomest igorrote ill with tonsilitis. (1905, Nov 22). *San Francisco Chronicle (1869-Current File)*. Retrieved from
<http://ezproxy.sfpl.org/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/365650737?accountid=35117>

Forty-one savages from bontoc province will give exhibitions at the exposition. (1907, May 20). *San Francisco Chronicle (1869-Current File)*. Retrieved from
<http://ezproxy.sfpl.org/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/251400190?accountid=35117>

Head-hunting Igorrotes' here. (1905, Nov 03). *San Francisco Chronicle (1869-Current File)*. Retrieved from
<http://ezproxy.sfpl.org/login?url=http://search.proquest.com/docview/365808318?accountid=35117>



